



SENATE OF THE FEDERAL REPUBLIC OF NIGERIA

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

Wednesday, 3rd July, 2019

1. The Senate met at 10:13 a.m. The President of the Senate read prayers.
2. **Votes and Proceedings:**
The Senate examined the Votes and Proceedings of Tuesday, 2nd July, 2019.

Question was put and the Votes and Proceedings were approved.

3. **Announcements:**

(a) ***Ad hoc Committee:***

The President of the Senate named the following Senators as Members of *Ad hoc* Committee on Media and Public Affairs:

(i)	Senator Clement A. Adeyeye	—	Chairman
(ii)	Senator Aishatu A. Dahiru	—	Member
(iii)	Senator Uba Sani	—	Member
(iv)	Senator Patrick A. Moro	—	Member
(v)	Senator Ifeanyi P. Ubah	—	Member
(vi)	Senator Be-ty J. Apiafi	—	Member

(b) ***Acknowledgment:***

The President of the Senate acknowledged the presence of the following who were at the gallery to observe Senate Proceedings:

- (i) Staff and Students of Redeemer Teap International School, Garki, Abuja; and
- (ii) Staff and Students of ECWA Yepwi Memorial College, New-Karu, Nasarawa State.

4. **Petition:**

Rising on Rule 41, Senator Jibrin I. Barau (*Kano North*) drew the attention of the Senate to a petition from his constituent, Alhaji Labaran Ahmed and three (3) others, against the Nigerian Defence Academy, Kaduna over withdrawal of four (4) Cadets. He urged the Senate to look into the matter.

Petition laid and accordingly referred to the Committee on Ethics, Privileges and Public Petitions [Rule 41(3)] to report within two (2) weeks, when constituted.

5. Privileges:

Rising on Rule 14, Senator Uba Sani (*Kaduna Central*) drew the attention of the Senate to the video of Senator Elisha C. Isiaku (*Adamawa North*) allegedly assaulting a lady. He stated that the video that went viral has infringed on his privilege as a Senator and the entire Senate as an institution. He emphasized that the Senate should be seen as protecting the rights and privileges of Nigerians in all ramifications. He urged the Senate to take a decisive action to redeem the credibility of the Senate of the Federal Republic of Nigeria and constitute an Ad hoc Committee to investigate the alleged assault.

*Debate***Ad hoc Committee on Alleged Assault by Senator Elisha C. Isiaku:**

(i)	Senator Samuel O. Egwu	—	Chairman
(ii)	Senator Oluremi S. Tinubu	—	Member
(iii)	Senator Matthew A. Urhohide	—	Member
(iv)	Senator Stella A. Oduah	—	Member
(v)	Senator Dauda H. Jika	—	Member
(vi)	Senator Danladi A. Sankara	—	Member
(vii)	Senator Mohammed S. Musa	—	Member

By the leave of the Senate, an Ad hoc Committee constituted to investigate the alleged assault and report within 2 weeks.

6. Motions:

(a) ***Urgent Need to Review the Import Duty of Soap Noodles:***

Motion made: That the Senate is aware that the Federal Government in order to boost local production of Soap Noodles increased its import duty to 35% from 10%;

aware that the increase in import duty made it unprofitable for the manufacturers of soaps to import Soap Noodles from overseas. This made the manufacturers to resort to making huge investment in setting up manufacturing lines to produce Soap Noodles in Nigeria to the tune of about ₦420 billion while creating 250,000 jobs in the country;

observes that recently, the Federal Government made a downward review of the import duty from 35% to 10%;

aware that this downward review will lead to massive importation of Soap Noodles into the country thereby having negative impact on the National Economy as follows:

- reduction in governments revenue drive;
- collapse of the soap noodles industry and its attendant unemployment;
- serves as impediments of government efforts towards developing local sourcing and self-sufficiency;
- acts as discouraging signals to investors; and
- putting pressure on the FOREX reserve and hence the stability of the naira; and

observes that the negative impacts of the policy on our economy that has just emerged from recession and the expected huge job losses if this policy is sustained will further destroy, degrade and imperil the chances of our economy for sustainable stability,

Accordingly resolves to:

urge the Federal Government to revert to 35% import duty on the importation of soap noodles to save the industry in particular and Nigeria economy in general (*Senator Barau I. Jibrin — Kano North*).

Debate:

Proposed Resolution:

Question: That the Senate do urge the Federal Government to revert to 35% import duty on the importation of soap noodles to save the industry in particular and Nigeria economy in general.

Amendment Proposed

Leave out the word “revert” in line 1, and insert the word “review” instead thereof (Senator Yusuf A. Yusuf — Taraba Central).

Question that the amendment be made, put and agreed to.

Additional Proposed Resolutions:

Insert Additional Proposed Resolutions as follows:

- (i) “That the Senate do urge the Federal Government to holistically embark on an urgent review of import duties of other imported manufacturing items with the view of protecting local industries” (Senator Teslim K. Folarin — Oyo Central).

Question that the amendment be made, put and agreed to.

- (ii) “That the Senate do urge a comprehensive review of the import substitution strategy of the Federal Government” (Senator Isah Jibrin — Kogi East).

Question that the amendment be made, put and agreed to.

- (iii) “That the Senate do refer this motion to the appropriate Committee when constituted to investigate the matter and report within four (4) weeks” (Senator Rose O. Oko — Cross River North).

Question that the amendment be made, put and agreed to.

Resolved:

That the Senate do:

- (i) urge the Federal Government to review to 35% import duty on the importation of soap noodles to save the industry in particular and Nigeria economy in general;
- (ii) urge the Federal Government to holistically embark on an urgent review of import duties of other imported manufacturing items with the view of protecting local industries;
- (iii) urge a comprehensive review of the import substitution strategy of the Federal Government; and
- (iv) refer this motion to the appropriate Committee when constituted to investigate the matter and report within four (4) weeks (S/Res/002/01/19).

- (b) **Avastin Injection: The case of ten Kaduna patients who went blind after administration of the Injection:**

Motion made: That the Senate alarmed at the use of Avastin injection meant for the treatment of Cancer at the National Eye Centre, Kaduna for eye treatment;

notes that on 28th May, 2019 ten patients visited the National Eye Centre, Kaduna unaided for poor eye sight due to cataract and other minor ailments, but to the shock of the patients and the general public at large, they went blind after taking an eye injection at the centre. This was reported in The Nation Newspaper of 20th and 29th June 2019 and the Daily Trust newspaper of 23rd June, 2019;

notes that the New York Times of 31st August 2011 had earlier reported that the same Avastin Injection, which was originally meant for cancer treatment, had caused blindness when applied for eye treatment;

aware that investigation confirmed that the ten patients went blind after they were given Russian made Avastin injection resulting to the patients being affected in both eyes, while the remaining six victims lost one eye each;

also aware that after the unfortunate incident, National Agency for Food Drug Administration and Control (NAFDAC) waded in and took the drug for a test but so far the result is still awaited;

notes that if this can happen in a government medical facility like the National Eye Centre, Kaduna, then it should be a matter of urgent national interest to look into the supplies of drugs in this country with emphasis on what our hospitals administer, to whom, preservation and expiration; and

worried that the victims were still under the care of the hospital as at 2nd July, 2019 (thirty three days after the incident) with little or no improvement. The harrowing experience of the victims are disheartening and a cause of worry by all and sundry. Therefore, mechanisms must be put in place to checkmate the anomalies in our health sector with the aim of correcting them and avoiding future recurrence.

Accordingly resolves to:

- (i) set up an Ad hoc Committee to carry out a holistic investigation on the use of the Avastin Injection for eye treatment leading to the blindness of the ten Nigerians;
- (ii) urge National Agency for Food Drug Administration and Control (NAFDAC) to make public the result of their test on the said injection and suspend the use of Avastin Injection by hospitals in Nigeria for eye treatment; and
- (iii) mandate the relevant authorities to compensate the victims and bring to book the practitioners found wanting (*Senator Aishatu A. Dahiru — Adamawa Central*).

Debate:

Proposed Resolution (i):

Question: That the Senate do set up an Ad-hoc Committee to carry out a holistic investigation on the use of the Avastin Injection for eye treatment leading to the blindness of the ten Nigerians.

Amendment Proposed

Leave out the provision in Proposed Resolution (i) and *insert* the following instead thereof: “constitute an Ad-hoc Committee to carry out a holistic investigation on the use of the Avastin Injection for eye treatment” (*Senator Bala Ibn Na’Allah — Kebbi South*).

Question that the amendment be made, put and agreed to.

Proposed Resolution (ii):

Question: That the Senate urge National Agency for Food Drug Administration and Control (NAFDAC) to make public the result of their test on the said injection and suspend the use of Avastin Injection by hospitals in Nigeria for eye treatment.

Amendment Proposed

Leave out the provision in Proposed Resolution (ii) and insert the following instead thereof: “urge National Agency for Food Drug Administration and Control (NAFDAC) to suspend forthwith the use of Avastin Injection by hospitals in Nigeria for eye treatment” (*Senator James E. Manager — Delta South*).

Question that the amendment be made, put and agreed to.

Proposed Resolution (iii):

Question: That the Senate do mandate the relevant authorities to compensate the victims and bring to book the practitioners found wanting — *Negatived*.

Additional Proposed Resolutions:

Insert Additional Proposed Resolutions as follows:

- (i) “That the Senate do urge Federal Ministry of Health (FMH) and National Agency for Food Drug Administration and Control (NAFDAC) to conduct Post Market Surveillance (PMS) periodically so as to determine efficacy of the drug or effective use” (*Senator Matthew A. Urhoghide — Edo South*).

Question that the amendment be made, put and agreed to.

- (ii) “That the Senate do urge the Federal Ministry of Health (FMH) and National Agency for Food Drug Administration and Control (NAFDAC) to explain to the Senate and Nigerians if they were aware of the banning of Avastin drug in the United States of America about eight years ago and why they have not discontinued its usage in Nigeria” (*Senator Michael O. Bamidele — Ekiti Central*).

Question that the amendment be made, put and agreed to.

Resolved:

That the Senate do:

- (i) constitute an Ad-hoc Committee to carry out a holistic investigation on the use of the Avastin Injection for eye treatment;
- (ii) urge the National Agency for Food Drug Administration and Control (NAFDAC) to suspend forthwith the use of Avastin Injection by hospitals in Nigeria for eye treatment;
- (iii) urge Federal Ministry of Health (FMH) and National Agency for Food Drug Administration and Control (NAFDAC) to conduct Post Market Surveillance (PMS) periodically so as to determine efficacy of the drug or effective use; and
- (iv) urge the Federal Ministry of Health (FMH) and National Agency for Food Drug Administration and Control (NAFDAC) to explain to the Senate and Nigerians if they were aware of the banning of Avastin drug in the United States of America about eight years ago and why they have not discontinued its usage in Nigeria (*S/Res/003/01/19*).

Ad hoc Committee:

The President of the Senate named the following Senators as Members of *Ad hoc Committee on Avastin Injection*:

- | | | | |
|-------|------------------------------|---|----------|
| (i) | Senator Matthew A. Urhoghide | — | Chairman |
| (ii) | Senator Yahaya I. Oloriegbe | — | Member |
| (iii) | Senator Aliyu A. Sabi | — | Member |

(iv)	Senator Chimaroke O. Nnamani	—	Member
(v)	Senator Aishatu A. Dahiru	—	Member
(vi)	Senator Robert A. Boroffice	—	Member
(vii)	Senator Bala Ibn Na' Allah	—	Member

By the leave of the Senate, the Ad hoc Committee should report within 2 weeks.

(c) ***Pipeline explosion in Komkom Town of Oyigbo Local Government Area of Rivers State:***

Motion made: That the Senate do notes that there was an oil pipeline explosion at Komkom Town in Oyigbo Local Government Area of Rivers State and over fifteen (15) persons died instantly with over fifty (50) persons suffered different degrees of injuries and properties worth millions of Naira consumed by the fire from the explosion;

aware that the discovery of Oil in the Niger Delta area of the country in 1957 is a huge blessing to the Nigerian nation as it has since become a source of our major national revenue;

notes that the distribution of the oil from the point of production to the point of either exportation or national use is done through pipelines;

recalls that majority of the pipelines were laid over fifty years ago and of course with time and usage they may have been weak in some sections;

understands that this and other factors could be attributed to the incessant pipeline explosions in the Niger Delta Region and other areas which have been a major cause of death;

recalls that such explosions have always brought irreparable devastating consequences on the people and the affected areas, as is often, such explosions usually change the environment and the livelihood of the people in the area;

recalls the occurrence of similar incidents that took place in the following areas which left scars of the devastation that are still fresh in our minds:

- The Soku explosion about eight (8) years ago that took hundreds of life and still kept many people maimed;
- The Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation (NNPC) Jetty at Okrika explosion about seven years ago which claimed the lives of over seventy (70) persons and left many persons maimed;
- The complete devastation of Ogoni Land for which help for remediation is still being sought; and
- On 22nd June, 2019 over fifteen (15) persons were identified dead and over fifty (50) persons with different degree of physical injuries. Several of such explosions have taken place in many parts of Rivers State with the usual attendant huge casualties;

worried that what seems to be a blessing to the entire nation is becoming a major curse in disguise to the host communities where both the production and distribution take place;

understands that two of the major causes of pipeline explosion are due to age of the pipes and vandals who try to pilfer crude oil for bunkering;

understands further that the Federal Government and indeed the Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation (NNPC) is spending huge sums of money on pipeline security;

believes that if all the agencies who are saddled with the responsibility of safety and security of the nation's oil pipelines are duly diligent in their responsibilities, pipelines explosion would have been a thing of the past;

believes also that such incessant explosions are alien to other major oil producing countries because of advanced surveillance technology and equipment they are using; and

regrets that the nation and indeed the Federal Government which is hugely benefitting from the accrueement from proceeds of the oil exploration and exploitation are not taking the appropriate actions to reduce or eliminate the occurrence of explosion.

Accordingly resolves to:

- (i) observe a minute silence in honour of those who lost their lives at the Komkom explosion and all other explosions that had taken place in the country in the past;
- (ii) sympathize with the Government and people of Rivers State and especially the Komkom people in Oyigbo Local Government Area;
- (iii) urge the Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation (NNPC), Petroleum Pipeline Marketing Company (PPMC) and all other agencies involved in the oil and Gas exploration and exploitation activities especially those involved with the laying of the pipelines to take a holistic survey of their pipelines so that very aged ones should be replaced;
- (iv) urge the Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation (NNPC), Petroleum Pipeline Marketing Company (PPMC) and other agencies in the oil and gas production sector to improve on the security of the nation's oil pipelines; and
- (v) urge the National Emergency Management Agency (NEMA) to visit the scene and provide succor to those affected (*Senator George T. Sekibo — Rivers East*).

Debate:

Proposed Resolution (i):

Question: That the Senate do observe a minute silence in honour of those who lost their lives at the Komkom explosion and all other explosions that had taken place in the country in the past — *Agreed to.*

Proposed Resolution (ii):

Question: That the Senate do sympathize with the Government and people of Rivers State and especially the Komkom people in Oyigbo Local Government Area — *Agreed to.*

Proposed Resolution (iii):

Question: That the Senate do urge the Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation (NNPC), Petroleum Pipeline Marketing Company (PPMC) and all other agencies involved in the Oil and Gas exploration and exploitation activities especially those involved with the laying of the pipelines to take a holistic survey of their pipelines so that very aged ones should be replaced.

Amendment Proposed:

Immediately after the word “PPMC” insert the word “oil companies” (*Senator Lawrence O. Ewghrudajakpo — Bayelsa West*).

Question that the amendment be made, put and agreed to.

Proposed Resolution (iv):

Question: That the Senate do urge the Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation (NNPC), Petroleum Pipeline Marketing Company (PPMC), oil companies and other agencies in the oil and gas production sector to improve on the security of the nation's oil pipelines — *Agreed to.*

Proposed Resolution (v):

Question: That the Senate do urge the National Emergency Management Agency (NEMA) to visit the scene and provide succor to those affected — *Agreed to.*

Additional Proposed Resolutions:

Insert Additional Proposed Resolutions as follows:

- (i) “That the Senate do urge the Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation (NNPC) medical team to take over the medical treatment of pipeline explosion survivors and pay the necessary compensation (*Senator Betty J. Apiafi — Rivers West*).

Question that the amendment be made, put and agreed to.

- (ii) That the Senate do urge the Federal Government to unbundle Petroleum Pipeline Marketing Company (PPMC), into Product Marketing and Pipeline Maintenance” (*Senator Stella A. Oduah — Anambra North*).

Question that the amendment be made, put and agreed to.

- (iii) That the Senate do constitute an Ad hoc Committee to investigate the cause(s) of the explosion to avert future occurrences and report within two (2) weeks” (*Senator Duoye Diri — Bayelsa Central*).

Question that the amendment be made, put and agreed to.

Resolved:

That the Senate do:

- (i) observe a minute silence in honour of those who lost their lives at the Komkom explosion and all other explosions that had taken place in the country in the past;
- (ii) sympathize with the Government and people of Rivers State and especially the Komkom people in Oyigbo Local Government Area;

- (iii) urge the Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation (NNPC), Petroleum Pipeline Marketing Company (PPMC), oil companies and all other agencies involved in the Oil and Gas exploration and exploitation activities especially those involved with the laying of the pipelines to take a holistic survey of their pipelines so that very aged ones should be replaced;
- (iv) urge the Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation (NNPC), Petroleum Pipeline Marketing Company (PPMC), oil companies and other agencies in the oil and gas production sector to improve on the security of the nation's oil pipelines;
- (v) urge the National Emergency Management Agency (NEMA) to visit the scene and provide succor to those affected;
- (vi) urge the Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation (NNPC) medical team to take over the medical treatment of pipeline explosion survivors and pay the necessary compensation;
- (vii) urge the Federal Government to unbundle Petroleum Pipeline Marketing Company (PPMC), into Product Marketing and Pipeline Maintenance; and
- (viii) constitute an Ad hoc Committee to investigate the cause(s) of the explosion to avert future occurrences and report within two (2) weeks (*S/Res/004/01/19*).

One minute silence accordingly observed in honour of the deceased.

Ad hoc Committee:

The President of the Senate named the following Senators as Members of *Ad hoc* Committee on Pipeline Explosion in Komkom, in Rivers State:

- | | | | |
|-------|------------------------------------|---|----------|
| (i) | Senator Abdullahi I. Gobir | — | Chairman |
| (ii) | Senator Stella A. Oduah | — | Member |
| (iii) | Senator Degi-Eremienyo B. Wangagha | — | Member |
| (iv) | Senator George T. Sekibo | — | Member |
| (v) | Senator Solomon O. Adeola | — | Member |
| (vi) | Senator Mohammed S. Musa | — | Member |
| (vii) | Senator Hassan A. Lawali | — | Member |

By the leave of the Senate, the Ad hoc Committee should report within 2 weeks.

- (d) ***The urgent need to make the National Health Insurance Scheme (NHIS) Work for Nigerians:***

Consideration of motion deferred to another Legislative day.

7. Adjournment:

Motion made: That the Senate do now adjourn till Thursday, 4th July, 2019 at 10.00 a.m. (*Senate Leader*).

Adjourned accordingly at 2:00 p.m.

Ahmad Ibrahim Lawan, CON
President,
Senate of the Federal Republic of Nigeria.