

2117

**SENATE OF THE FEDERAL
REPUBLIC OF NIGERIA**

Wednesday, 23rd March, 2016

The Senate met at 10:54 a.m.

PRAYERS

(The President in the Chair)

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

The President: Distinguished Senators, we have the Votes and Proceedings of Tuesday, 22nd March, 2016 before us for approval. We will start consideration from page 591- 593.

Senator Abdullahi Adamu (Nasarawa West): Mr. President, I move that the Votes and Proceedings of Tuesday, 22nd March, 2016 be approved.

Senator Matthew A. Urhoghide (Edo South): Mr. President, I second the Motion that the Votes and Proceedings of Tuesday, 22nd March, 2016 be approved.

Question put and agreed to.

Resolved: That the Votes and Proceedings of Tuesday, 22nd March, 2016 be approved.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

The President: This letter is from the Chairman, Senate Services, Senator Ibrahim Abdullahi Gobir and it reads:

The President,
Senate of the Federal Republic of Nigeria,
National Assembly,
Abuja.

Your Excellency,

Re-Production of 2016 Senate Calendar

Sequel to my letter of 10th April, 2016 on the above subject, Distinguished Senators are to note that the corrected sample of the 2016 Calendar is being circulated in the Chambers.

2. Distinguished Senators are requested to scrutinize their details contained therein to ensure that corrections earlier made by them were effected. All observations are to be made on the attached comment sheet.

2118

3. Please, accept the assurances of my highest regards.

(Signed)

Senator Ibrahim Abdullahi Gobir
Chairman

Joint Committee Meeting

There will be a Joint Committee meeting of the following Committees, of both Senate and House of Representatives:

- (1) Senate Committee on National Planning and Economic Affairs;
- (2) Health; and
- (3) Appropriation; on the dissemination of the said Reports on budgetary trend on Child and Maternal Health in Nigeria; organised by the National Institute of Legislative Studies (NILS). The schedule is as follows:

Date: Wednesday, 23rd March, 2016

Time: 2:00 p.m. prompt.

Venue: Meeting Room 117, Senate New Building,
1stFloor

(Signed)

Senator Rabi'u Musa Kwankwaso

PDP Senate Caucus Meeting

There will be a meeting of the PDP Senate caucus as follows:

Date: 23rd March, 2016

Time: 7:00 p.m.

Venue: No. 20 Colorado Street, Maitama

Attendance: Compulsory

(Signed)

Senator Godswill Akpabio (Minority Leader)

2119

Invitation to Thanksgiving Service by Senator Mao Oluabunwa

22nd March, 2016

Dr. Bukola Saraki, CON,
The Senate President,
National Assembly,
Abuja.

Reminder and Invitation to attend Thanksgiving Service, Holding at Arochukwu, Abia State

I wish to remind all my Colleagues attending my Thanksgiving Service scheduled at Arochukwu, Abia State on the 28th March, 2016 that adequate logistic arrangements have been made for transportation of our guests from Sam Mbakwe Airport Owerri, and accommodation provided at Umuahia.

Our guests making the trip are to fly to Sam Mbakwe Airport, Owerri, and the following flights are available: Sunday, 27th March, 2016 - Arik at 11: 30 a.m. or Air Peace scheduled for 11:00 a.m. or 3.10 p.m. While those coming on Monday, 28th March, 2016 can join Arik scheduled for 7:30 a.m.

I look forward to seeing you at Ugwu-Avo, Arochukwu, Abia State on 28th, March, 2016 and those coming should please give their names and flight schedules to Senator T. A. Orji (Ochendo Worldwide) or Senator Sam Anyanwu.

Thank you and God bless you all as you come.

(Signed)

Senator Mao Oluabunwa

Invitation to Wedding Ceremony of Folashade Elizabeth Melaye

23rd March, 2016

His Excellency,
Distinguished Senator Abubakar Bukola Saraki,
President of the Senate,
National Assembly Complex,
Abuja.

Special Wedding Invitation

I am highly delighted to notify Distinguished Senators about the wedding solemnization of my only sister; Folashade Elizabeth Melaye to her heartthrob Oyewale Abdulrazak.

Their happy day is scheduled as follows:

Date: Saturday, 26th March, 2016

2120

Venue: The Apostle Church, Oke Ayo,

Iluaafon Assembly, Ayotoro Gbede, Kogi State;

Time: 10.00 a.m. prompt.

To this end, it is with full and hopeful heart that I formally request for the honour of the presence of my Distinguished Colleagues at this wedding solemnisation.

Your presence will make complete, the couple's public declaration of love and commitment.

We do hope that you will join us for the ceremony, and for a reception immediately afterward, at my residence, Aiyetoro Gbede, Kogi State.

We covet your earnest prayers for the couple.

Thank you all.

Yours sincerely,

Senator Dino Melaye

Letter from Senator Samuel N. Anyanwu

16th March, 2016

The Senate President,
Senate Chambers,
National Assembly,
Abuja.

Activities of some Clandestine Operators of the Social Media

The Joint Committee on Ethics, Privileges and Public Petitions; Judiciary, Human Rights and Legal Matters; and ICT on Cyber-Crime in respect of a petition laid by Senator Dino Melaye on 10th December, 2015, where he complained about the activities of some Clandestine Operators of the social media, especially Sahara Reporters from New York, USA, will meet on Tuesday, 5th April, 2016 at meeting Room 120, First Floor, New Senate Wing at 2:00 p.m.

All members of the three Committees are requested to attend unfailingly, please.

Thank you.

(Signed)

Senator Samuel N. Anyanwu

On behalf of the Joint Committee

2121

Visitors in the Gallery

I wish to acknowledge the presence of Staff and Students of Baptist New Way Academy, Suleja – Niger State; Staff and Students of Metro International Schools, Kubwa – Abuja; and Staff and Students of Chrisland School, Apo – Abuja, who are in the Gallery to observe Senate Proceedings.

I wish them all a fruitful observation of the Senate Proceedings.

(Visitors stood for recognition)

You may sit.

PRESENTATION OF PUBLIC PETITION

Petition against the Council of Legal Education

Senator David Umaru (Niger East): Mr. President, Point of Order.

The President: What is your Point of Order, Senator Umaru?

Senator David Umaru: Mr. President, I come under Order 41, it reads:

A petition may only be presented to the Senate by a Senator, who shall affix his name at the beginning thereof.

I have a petition by Law Students Association of National Open University of Nigeria Graduates. The petition is against the non-inclusion of the National Open University of Nigerian Law Graduates in participating in the compulsory one year training with the Nigerian Law School by the Council of Legal Education.

They have not sought any legal remedy.

(Petition laid)

Petition against the Nigerian Army over Unlawful Dismissal

Senator Oluremi Shade Tinubu (Lagos Central): Mr. President, I come under Order 41, which reads:

A petition may only be presented to the Senate by a Senator, who shall affix his name at the beginning thereof.

I have a petition from a lady Private from the Nigerian Army; she is Private Eze Charity who was dismissed unlawfully. The petition is a very serious one and disheartening.

2122

She is making this complain against some Army officers and Soldiers over sexual molestation, rape, abuse of power and unlawful dismissal from the Nigerian Army. She has not sought for any legal action till date. She wants the Senate to help her intervene and reinstate her back to the service.

(Petition laid.)

Petition against the Federal Capital Territory Administration

Senator Obinna Joseph Ogba (Ebonyi Central): Mr. President, I come under Order 41, which reads:

A petition may only be presented to the Senate by a Senator, who shall affix his name at the beginning thereof.

The petition is against the Nigerian Police for unlawful sale of a Tanker Truck loaded with oil, and another one from the Nigerian Civil Service Union against the Federal Capital territory Administration. May I have your kind permission to lay it on Table?

(Petition laid)

(Petitions accordingly referred to the Committee on Ethics and Privileges to be report back in two weeks)

PRESENTATION OF BILLS

Senator Mohammed Ali Ndume: Mr. President, the first Business of the Day is the presentation of eight (8) Bills. You may wish to invite the Clerk of the Senate to read the Short Titles of the Bills.

Emergency Powers Bill, 2016

Emergency Powers Bill, 2016 (SB. 182) – presented by Senator John Owan Enoh (Cross Rivers Central); *read the First Time.*

Prisons Act CAP P29 LFN 2004 (Amendment) Bill, 2016

Prisons Act CAP P29 LFN 2004 (Amendment) Bill, 2016 (SB. 191) – presented by Senator Oluremi Tinubu (Lagos Central); *read the First Time.*

University Teaching Hospital (Reconstitution of Boards, Etc.)

Act CAP U15 LFN 2004 (Amendment) Bill, 2016

University Teaching Hospital (Reconstitution of Boards, Etc.) Act CAP U15 LFN 2004 (Amendment) Bill, 2016 (SB. 194) – presented by Senator Chukwuka Utazi (Enugu North); *read the First Time.*

2123

Police Act CAP P19 LFN 2004 (Repeal and Re-enactment Bill, 2016

Police Act CAP P19 LFN 2004 (Repeal and Re-enactment Bill, 2016 (SB. 200) – presented by Senator Obinna Ogba (Ebonyi Central); *read the First Time*.

Explosives Act CAP E18 LFN 2004 (Repeal and Re-enactment) Bill, 2016

Explosives Act CAP E18 LFN 2004 (Repeal and Re-enactment) Bill, 2016 (SB. 227) – presented by Senator Danjuma La'ah (Kaduna South); *read the First Time*.

National Research and Innovation (Est., Etc.) Bill, 2016

National Research and Innovation (Est., Etc.) Bill, 2016 (SB. 239) – presented by Senator David Umaru (Niger East); *read the First Time*

National Inland Waterways Act CAP N47 (Repeal and Re-enactment) Bill, 2016

National Inland Waterways Act CAP N47 (Repeal and Re-enactment) Bill, 2016 (SB. 240) – presented by Senator Andy Uba (Anambra South); *read the First Time*.

Federal Polytechnic Act CAP F17 LFN 2004 (Amendment) Bill, 2016

Federal Polytechnic Act CAP F17 LFN 2004 (Amendment) Bill, 2016 (SB. 241) – presented by Senator Ali Wakili (Bauchi South); *read the First Time*.

PRESENTATION OF REPORTS

Reports of the Committee on Ethics, Privileges and Public Petitions

Senator Mohammed Ali Ndume: Mr President, the ninth Business of the Day is the Presentation of four Reports of the Committee on Ethics, Privileges and Public Petition. You may wish to invite Senator Samuel Anyanwu to move the motion for the Senate to receive the Reports.

The President: Senator Samuel Anyanwu, can you move the motion for the four items at the same time?

Senator Samuel Nnaemeka Anyanwu (Imo East): Mr. President, I move that the Senate do receive the following Reports:

2124

Petition against Chevron Nigeria Limited

- (i) Report of the Committee on Ethics, Privileges and Public Petitions in respect of a Petition from Dr. George Uboh of Panic Alert Security System (PASS) against Chevron Nigeria Limited for fraud of over Four Hundred and Twenty-Six Million, Four Hundred and Sixty-Four Thousand, One Hundred U.S Dollars (\$4,26,464, 100.00).

Petition against the Nigerian Navy

- (ii) Report of the Committee on Ethics, Privileges and Public Petitions in respect of a Petition from Mrs. Oluwafemi Fakiyesi and one other against the Nigerian Navy over the sudden death of Lt. Commander Oluwafemi Fakiyesi while on Duty.

Petition against the Hospital Management

- (iii) Report of the Committee on Ethics, Privileges and Public Petitions in respect of a Petition from Association of Resident Doctors of Nigeria, Federal Neuropsychiatric Hospital, Kaduna against the Hospital Management over the non-implementation of the Consolidated Medical Salary Structure (CONMESS) and *skipping* Allowance.

Petition against Diamond Bank Plc

- (iv) Report of the Committee on Ethics, Privileges and Public Petition in respect of a petition from Mrs. Regina Poto against Diamond Bank Plc. alleged force disengagement from the service of the bank.

I so move.

Senator Suleiman Mohammed Nazif (Bauchi North): Mr. President, I second the motion ably moved by Chairman, Committee on Ethics and Privileges.

Question put and agreed to.

(Reports laid on the Table)

Report on the indiscriminate use and Abuse of Waivers

Senator Mohammed Ali Ndume: Mr. President, the next Business of the Day is the presentation of the Report of the Ad-Hoc Committee on Import Duty Waivers, Concessions and Grants on the indiscriminate use and abuse of Waivers.

2125

You may wish to invite Senator Adamu Aliero, Chairman of the Committee to move the Motion for the Senate to receive the Report.

Senator Muhammad Adamu Aliero (Kebbi Central): Mr. President, I move that the Senate do receive the Report of Ad-Hoc Committee on Import Duty Waivers, Concessions and Grants in respect of Motions on indiscriminate use and abuse of Waivers.

Senator Emmanuel Izibefien Paulker (Bayelsa Central): Mr. President, I second the Motion ably moved by Senator Adamu Aliero.

Question put and agreed to.

(Report laid on the Table)

ORDERS OF THE DAY

CONSIDERATION OF REPORTS

Diplomatic Immunities (Regional Episcopal Conference of West Africa), No. 11 Order 2016

Senator Mohammed Ali Ndume: Mr. President, the first Order of the Day is the consideration of the Diplomatic Immunities (Regional Episcopal Conference of West Africa) Order No. 11 2016. You will recall that the Episcopal Order was laid on Tuesday, 8th March, 2016.

With your permission, I wish to move the Motion for the Senate to consider the Episcopal Order. The purpose of this is to refer it to the relevant Committee of the Senate.

Senator Godswill Obot Akpabio: Mr. President, I second the Motion as ably moved by the Leader.

Question put and agreed to.

(Report accordingly referred to the Committee on Foreign Affairs for further legislative action and to bring the report back in two weeks' time).

The Report of the Conference Committee on MTEF

Senator Mohammed Ali Ndume: Mr. President, the second Order of the Day is the presentation and consideration of the Conference Committee on the 2016, 2017 and 2018 Medium-Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) and Fiscal Strategy Paper (FSP).

You will recall that the Senate and the House of Representatives passed different versions of 2016, 2017 and 2018 Medium-Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) and Fiscal Strategy Paper (FSP).

2126

The Conference Committee of both Houses has met and harmonised the differences in accordance with the Senate Standing Order 88.

You may wish to invite Senate Enoh to move the Motion for the Senate to receive and consider the Conference Report.

Senator John Owan Enoh (Cross River Central): Mr. President, I move that the Senate do consider the report of the Conference Committee on the 2016, 2017 and 2018 Medium-Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) and Fiscal Strategy Paper (FSP).

Senator Wakili Mallam Ali (Bauchi South): Mr. President, I second the Motion that the Senate do consider the Report of the Conference Committee on the 2016, 2017 and 2018 Medium-Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) and Fiscal Strategy Paper (FSP).

Question put and agreed to.

Resolved: That the Senate do consider the Report of the Conference Committee on the 2016, 2017 and 2018 Medium-Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) and Fiscal Strategy Paper (FSP).

The President: Senator John Enoh, present the report please.

Senator John Owan Enoh: Mr. President, this is a report of the National Assembly Conference Committee on the 2016, 2017 and 2018 Medium-Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) and Fiscal Strategy Paper (FSP). Following the consideration and the passage of the 2016-2018 Medium Term Expenditure Framework and Fiscal Strategy Paper of the Federal Government by the Senate and the House of Representatives on the 16th and 17th December, 2015 respectively, the two Chambers of the National Assembly set up a Conference Committee to reconcile areas of differences in the recommendations.

Membership of the Senate:

(1)	Senator John Owan Enoh -	Chairman
(2)	Senator Rafiu A. Ibrahim -	Member
(3)	Senator Umaru I. Kurfi -	Member
(4)	Senator Solomon O. Adeola -	Member
(5)	Senator Andy E. Uba -	Member
(6)	Senator Yusuf A. Yusuf -	Member

Membership of the House of Representatives:

(1)	Hon. Babangida Ibrahim -	Chairman
(2)	Hon. Abdulmumin Jibrin -	Member
(3)	Hon. Adeyinka Ajayi -	Member
(4)	Hon. Timothy Golu -	Member
(5)	Hon. Jephthah Foingha -	Member

2127

The Conference Committee met on Wednesday, 2nd March, 2016 to harmonise the differences in the recommendations as passed by both Chambers. The two Chambers passed different versions in recommendation (G) and (L) as shown in the table.

The two Chambers passed different versions in recommendation (G) and (L) as shown in the table below:

Recommendations for Conference:

S/N	SENATE	HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVE	CONFERENCE COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION
1.	(G) That the implementation of Treasury Single Account (TSA) with e-Collection platform be sustained.	Negatived	House of Representatives version adopted
2.	(L) Arrears of 2015 fuel subsidy for domestic consumption as proposed in the MTEF be sustained.	Negatived	Senate version adopted

Let me however indicate that the adoption of the House position on the TSA does not at all indicate the fact that the National Assembly is not in support of the Federal Government's initiative on this; the Senate in various resolutions at this Chamber have actually openly applauded this initiative. Therefore, the adoption of the House version as I have said does not affect that.

Recommendation:

After a thorough scrutiny of the recommendation as passed by the two Chambers, the Conference Committee adopted Senate version in recommendation (L) while House of Representatives version in recommendation (G) was adopted.

Conclusion:

The Conference Committee wishes to express its gratitude to the Senate and to the House of Representatives for the opportunity to serve.

Senator James Ebiowou Manager (Delta South): Mr. President, my comment is not on the substance of the Conference Committee's Report; I just want to commend the Committee, not the Conference Committee but the Committee of the Senate that participated in the Conference Committee.

If you look at the signature page, there is a standard and for almost eight years, we battled with it but this particular Committee has come up with a standard which must be followed and that standard is, Senator John Owan Enoh signed as Chairman of the Conference Committee then the Chairman on the other side signed as Chairman House Committee on Finance. This is a standard Sir, which is very important and significant.

Otherwise, before now, we used to have Chairman on this side then co-Chairman on the other side. It is good that you have come from the House of Representatives and therefore you now understand how we feel here. Thank you very much for a job well done. *(Laughter)*

The President: Senator James Manager, that is a very good observation. Is there any other comments or observations?

Senator Dino Melaye (Kogi West): Mr. President, I want to draw our attention to page 2 – *Recommendation for Conference* – the Senate took a position that the implementation of the Treasury Single Account with e-Collection platform be sustained. The House of Representatives negatived it and the Conference Committee in their wisdom accepted the recommendation of the House of Representatives; but I want to draw our attention that the importance of the e-Collection platform in the Treasury Single Account cannot be overemphasised.

I am even challenging the rationale and the logic behind any contrary opinion to the position of the Senate on this matter.

The President: Senator Dino Melaye, I am sure that you are also aware that it is a Conference Report; we want comments and do not intend to go into discussion. Is there any other comments?

Senator Barau I. Jibrin (Kano North): Mr. President, this is a Conference Committee Report and it is well put together, we need not to waste more time in debating what is being put here, it is properly done. So, I urge this Senate to pass it so that we can move forward.

Question put and agreed to.

Resolved: That the Senate do approve the Report of the National Assembly Conference Committee on the 2016 – 2018 Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) and Fiscal Strategy Paper (FSP).

Report on the 2016 Appropriation Bill

Senator Mohammed Ali Ndume: Mr. President, the Third Order of the day is the Consideration of the Report of the Committee on Appropriation on the 2016 Appropriation Bill.

2129

2130

You will recall that the Report was laid on Tuesday 22nd March, 2016.

With your permission, I wish to move the motion for the Senate to resolve into the Committee of Supply to consider the Report.

Senator Godswill Obot Akpabio: Mr. President, I second the motion as ably moved by the Leader.

Question put and agreed to.

Report on the Appropriation Bill, 2016 –
CONSIDERED IN THE COMMITTEE OF SUPPLY.

(The Chairman in the Chair)

Senator Mohammed Danjuma Goje (Gombe Central): Mr. President, I move that the Committee of Supply do consider the Report of the Committee on Appropriation on the 2016 Appropriation Bill.

Senator Andy Emmanuel Uba (Anambra South): Mr. President, I second that the Senate do consider the Report of the Committee on the 2016 Appropriation Bill.

Question put and agreed to.

Resolved: That the Senate do consider the Report of the Committee on Appropriation on the 2106 Appropriation Bill.

The President: Senator Danjuma Goje, present your Report

Senator Mohammed Danjuma Gombe (Gombe Central): Mr. President, you will recall that on Tuesday 22nd December, 2016, the President of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, President Muhammadu Buhari laid before a Joint Sitting of the National Assembly, the 2016 Appropriation Bill containing the estimates of revenue and expenditure of the Federation of 2016 Fiscal Year in the aggregate sum of ₦6,077,680,000,000 (Six Trillion, Seventy-Seven Billion, Six Hundred and Eighty Million) Naira only, of which, ₦351,370,000,000 (Three Hundred and Fifty-One Billion, Three Hundred and Seventy Million) Naira only, is for Statutory Transfers, (₦1,475,320,000,000 (One Trillion, Four Hundred and Seventy-Five Billion, Three Hundred and Twenty Million) Naira only, is for Debt Service, ₦2,648,600,000,000 (Two Trillion, Six Hundred and Forty-Eight Billion, Six Hundred Million) Naira only, is for Recurrent (Non-Debt) Expenditure while the sum of ₦1,845,540,000,000 (One Trillion, Eight Hundred and Forty-Five Billion, Five Hundred and Forty Million) Naira inclusive of ₦157,150,000,000 (One Hundred and Fifty-Seven Billion, One Hundred and Fifty Million) Naira Capital Expenditure in Statutory Transfers and ₦86,000,000,000 (Eighty-Six Billion) Naira as interest on Capitalized loans, is for contribution to the Development Fund for Capital Expenditure for the year ending 31st December, 2016.

Legislative Action:

The Senate debated the general principles of the Bill on Wednesday, 20th, Thursday, 21st, Tuesday 26th and Wednesday 27th January, 2016 respectively. The Bill was read the Second Time on 27th January, 2016 and consequently referred to the Committee on Appropriations for further legislative action.

Thereafter, the Committee developed a work plan in consultation with the Senate leadership and the leadership of the Standing Committees to advance work on the Bill. Subsequently, work at the level of the various Sub-Committees of Appropriations held between 1st February, 2016 and 8th March, 2016.

In the course of the work of the Committee, a joint meeting of the Senate and House Committees on Appropriation held an interactive Session with the Hon. Minister of Budget and National Planning, Hon. Minister of Finance, Governor of Central Bank, Accountant-General of the Federation and the Director-General, Budget Office of the Federation. The meeting aid in clarifying grey areas of the budget.

Revenue Assumptions for the 2016 Budget:

In preparing details of the 2016 Bill, the Committee adopted a benchmark price of \$38 per barrel on crude oil, based on the recommendation of the Senate on the Medium Term Expenditure Framework/Fiscal Strategy Paper (MTEF/FSP). The Executive proposals of crude oil production of 2.2 million barrels per day (mbpd) and an exchange rate of ₦197 to \$1 were adopted, as shown below:

S/N	Description	2016 Proposal	2016 NASS Proposal
1.	Benchmark price	Oil US\$38.00pb	US\$38.00pb
2.	Crude Production	Oil 2.2000mbpd	2.2000mbpd
3.	Exchange Rate	₦197/US\$1	197/US\$1

Highlights:

After due consideration of the submissions by Sub-Committees and interaction with relevant stakeholders, the highlights of the Bill as recommended by this Committee are as follows:

Aggregate Expenditure -	₦6,060,677,358,227
Subsidy Transfers -	₦351,370,000,000
Debt Service -	₦1,475,320,000,000

2131

Recurrent Expenditure -	₦2,646,389,236,196
Capital Expenditure -	₦1,587,598,122,031
Fiscal Deficit -	₦2,204,936,925,711.16
Deficit/GDP -	2.14 <i>per cent</i>

Observations:

The Committee observed as follows:

- (i) The 2016 Appropriation Bill, which is the first by the President Muhammadu Buhari's administration, was not presented on time to the National Assembly. This subsequently affected the timely passage of the Bill.
- (ii) The 2016 Appropriation Bill, after its presentation to the National Assembly was seen to be fraught with some inconsistencies from MDAs; given the subsequent reference to enable the National Assembly conduct proper engagement and to conclude the budget processes in good time. This was also noticed at the level of the Sub-committees. This is strange and goes against proper budgetary procedures and processes; with attendant implications.
- (iii) The available revenue for Appropriations is grossly inadequate to meet the huge demand of MDAs to prosecute needed programmes for national development across all spars of the economy.
- (iv) The 2016 Bill seeks to stimulate the economy but the recurrent expenditure as compared to the capital component at a ratio of 30:70 *per cent* is still very high. This takes away from the infrastructure-stimulus funding that the country so desperately needs for real development.
- (v) The 2016 Appropriation Bill contained a number of omissions, particularly in the area of personnel cost. Though the Appropriations Committee has filled some of the gaps, there are many outstanding cases which could raise serious concern in the course of the year.

Recommendations:

- (i) Subsequent Budgets should be submitted in strict compliance with the provisions of the Fiscal Responsibility Act to enable the National Assembly conduct proper engagement and to conclude the budget processes in good time.

2132

- (ii) There should be proper engagement in future between the Budget Office of the Federation and the MDAs on budget contents in order to avoid what appears to be a disconnect between them in the processing of budget proposals. This is very important because we had a situation where Ministers disown budgets submitted by the budget office. We recommend that there must be proper consultation between the budget office and the various MDAs so that by the time the budget is submitted to National Assembly there will be no argument between the budget office and the MDAs during the budget defence. This will also ensure that the Budget proposal between the two parties is in harmony.
- (iii) Government must endeavour to increase and diversify its revenue generation streams; given the yawning gap between collectible revenue and actual collections.
- (iv) Recurrent expenditure, relative to capital expenditure should be driven down; such a ratio in favour of an increased capital expenditure profile will ensure that the capital thrust of the budget is delivered to the Nigeria people. We commend the 30 *per cent* capital *vis-a-vis* 30 *per cent* recurrent. But the Committee recommends that in the next budget we want to see a higher proportion in favour of capital so as to really deliver what is supposed to be delivered to Nigerian people properly.
- (v) From the 2017 fiscal year, Government should endeavour to shore up capital expenditure by substantially reducing recurrent expenditure. We are emphasising the fact that there should a reduction in recurrent expenditure in favour of capital expenditure. This is the only way to free up resources for critical infrastructure towards economic growth and development.

Prayer:

Mr. President, as due consideration has been given to the preparation of the 2016 Appropriation Bill, the Committee hereby recommends that the Senate should consider and approve the Bill for an Act to authorise the issue from the Consolidated Revenue Fund of the Federation, the total sum of ₦6,060,677,358,227 (Six Trillion, Sixty Billion, Six Hundred and Seventy-Seven Million, Three Hundred and Fifty-Eight Thousand, Two Hundred and Twenty-Two Hundred and Twenty-Seven Naira) only, of which , ₦351,370,000,000 (Three Hundred and Fifty-One Billion, Three Hundred and Seventy Million Naira) only is for Statutory Transfers,

2133

₦1,475,320,000,000 (One Trillion, Four Hundred and Seventy-Five Billion, Three Hundred and Twenty Million Naira) only is for Debt Service, ₦2,646,389,236,196 (Two Trillion, Six Hundred and Forty-Six Billion, Three Hundred and Eighty-Nine Million, Two Hundred and Thirty-Six Thousand, One Hundred and Ninety-Six Naira) only is for Recurrent (Non-Debt) Expenditure while the sum of ₦1,587,598,122,031 (One Trillion, Five Hundred and Eighty-Seven Billion, Five Hundred and Ninety-Eight Million, One Hundred and Twenty-Two Thousand, Thirty-One Naira) is for contribution to the Development Fund for Capital Expenditure for the year ending 31st December, 2016.

Conclusion:

In view of the revenue and general economic challenges confronting the nation, the Committee, has in a landmark decision, not witnessed since the advent of the present democratic dispensation in 1999, reduced the size of the aggregate expenditure and consequently reduced the total recurrent, deficit and borrowing plan.

What am I saying? For the first time since 1999, this Committee recommends the reduction of the budget size from Executive brought to National Assembly as opposed to all the previous years, whereby the Assembly increased what was put before it by the Executive. We did this in view of the economic challenges facing the nation - the sharp drop in the price of crude oil and other challenges facing the government. We recommend the budget to be reduced so that the Executive will be able to implement it in full. This is our landmark recommendation and I hope that my Colleagues will bear with us.

The Committee wishes to thank the leadership and Distinguished Senators for the support given to it in the course of this work. We also thank the Appropriations sub-Committee for their co-operation in bringing this assignment to a successful end.

The President: Is there any comment?

Senator Ike Ekweremadu (Enugu West): Mr. President, I am very conscious of the fact that we have passed the Second Reading and so this is not opened to debate. I will just like to make a very quick comment but in doing so, let me start by commending the Chairman of the Appropriation Committee and its Members as well as Chairmen of the various Committees of the Senate for the very outstanding job they have done to get this Budget up to this level, which is now ready for passage today.

Having said this, I am a bit worried about the observation contained on page 5, paragraph 5. It reads:

2134

The 2016 Appropriation Bill contain a number of omissions, particularly in the area of personnel cost. Though the Appropriation Committee has filled some of the gaps, there are many outstanding cases which could raise serious concerns in the course of the year.

Mr. President, the Executive presented what we considered to be a proposal and so the ultimate responsibility for this budget rests on us Members of National Assembly. If there are mistakes on the part of the Executive, I think it ends at the point they presented the budget. If anything happens after that and we pass the budget, we cannot blame them any longer. Therefore, we will like to know what these outstanding cases are because it appears they are in relation to personnel cost. It will not be a good commentary on this Senate and indeed National Assembly if down the line during the year, we discover that some of the people we are representing cannot be paid because we refuse or have failed or neglected to appropriate for them their due salaries and emoluments. That will not be right.

Therefore, I will ask the Chairman if he can oblige us those areas that are still outstanding especially as it concerns personnel cost so that we can take the advantage of this consideration now to fill in these gaps so that every citizen of Nigeria that is entitled to his pay will receive his pay appropriately and he cannot say that he will not receive it because we failed to do our job and we cannot blame the Executive because we now have the opportunity to address this problems.

Senator Danjuma Goje: Thank you Mr President. This budget exercise was full of negotiations going front and back. When the budget was presented as attested by many Committees, there were shortages discovered including those covering personnel cost in various Committees. These were highlighted by the various sub-Committees and the total amount involved was presented to the Executive.

During the course of our interaction with the budget office, we presented to them the short falls for personnel and other overhead costs which we believe should be taken care of. They promised to do that but somehow, they did it half way and since they did it half way, we also did it half way. But for critical organisations, most of them were satisfied but we still have pockets to fill that we believe will have few problems and the budget office confirmed to us that later in the year, they may come with something that will make it up.

2135

Therefore, because this budget is full of controversy, we did not want to add more controversy. If we have added more controversy, the Report would not have been submitted today and the National Assembly would be blamed for delaying this Budget. That is why we did everything possible to ensure that we beat the deadline and bring it today. If we are to continue negotiation, the negotiation would have continued back and front and Nigerians will not understand this and they will say the National Assembly is playing politics with the budget and there is no politics in this budget. We are doing everything possible to ensure that we present our budget that is implementable to Nigerians.

The President: Distinguished Colleagues, I just want to guide us that we have passed the point of debate on general principle, so our comments and observations should be on the clauses and schedules specifically just to guide us.

Senator Mohammed Ali Ndume: Mr. President, I still want to join our colleagues to commend the Committee for working up and living up to the deadline we gave ourselves. Mine is just a kind of clarification of figures. Our colleagues unanimously supported a Motion that we brought in respect of a situation on our IDPs and this Senate directed the Committee to provide in a service wide vote ₦10 Billion for the resettlement and relocation of the IDPs. I just want to be sure that is included in the details of the budget from the Chairman.

Senator Kabiru Ibrahim Gaya (Kano South): Mr. President, I would like to commend the Chairman and Members of the Committee on Appropriation for doing a very good job and all the Senators and Chairmen of the Senate Committees for working very hard to make sure that this budget is going to be a budget that is for change and development of this country.

My observation is that in this Senate, we passed a resolution that the budget is going to be a twelve calendar budget and that the budget will be for one year. But on page 7 of the Chairman's Report, the last sentence of the paragraph under his prayer clearly stated and I quote:

After putting the money for contribution, the capital expenditure for the year ending 31st December, 2016

What we agreed at the sitting here is that any time the President signs the budget, we will now go for twelve calendar months.

The President: That has been taken care of if you look at page 3 of 9.

2136

Senator Godswill Obot Akpabio: Mr. President, I just want to join the former speakers to congratulate the Chairman of the Committee, Senator Goje, and all the Members and the other Sub-Committees, Members and Chairmen for a job well done most especially for the observations contained in this paper on the inconsistencies, the delays and shoddy jobs done on the budget by different MDAs. I know that as a result of the fact that this is the first major budget of the current administration, this will not be part of the change, this is likely to be just maybe mistakes and disconnect, because in a situation where Ministries and MDAs will deny their own budget before the Appropriation Committee is not good for our country.

The Report as contained here is very frank, factual and straightforward and this is apolitical and I believe that this should be the spirit of this Senate. If we work like this, we will help Mr. President to move this country forward.

Therefore, I share in the sentiment expressed by the Deputy Senate President that we still have an ample opportunity to address maybe one or two salient points. For instance, if there are MDAs or Personnel in the country that will not receive their salaries on account of omission here, then, we will be blamed.

If the MDAs and the Ministries did a poor job out of the budget, the Senate cannot rubber stamp the poor job because if we do so, it means we are failing in our responsibilities to guide the administration properly. I believe strongly that we will be having a change in the wrong direction.

It is important that we ask the Chairman again whether there is nothing that can be done to ameliorate the situation, because the adage says a labourer is entitled to his wages.

Distinguished Colleagues, is this a Conference Report?

Several distinguished Senators: Yes.

Senator Godswill Obot Akpabio: If it is a dead issue, it means some people are not going to get their salaries this year. That is why I am worried but on the whole, I commend the frankness and the job well done and I urge my Colleagues to support the Chairman while the explanation of the Deputy Senate President should be taken into cognisance.

Senator Mohammed Danjuma Goje: Mr. President, in our Report, we tried to highlight that that there is going to be a problem but there is a small window where government can handle it because in the Service Wide Vote, there is a provision for contingency. There is also another provision for adjustment on salary differences; this too can take care of most of these things.

2137

I also want to emphasise that these are Conference Committees because the House of Representatives is presenting exactly identical report with us.

The President: Distinguished Colleagues, as I earlier said that if there are specifics on the Clause or Schedules and not on Principle, let us go ahead on Schedule and Clauses.

Senator Dino Melaye: Mr. President, I just want to bring to the attention of the Chairman that the Federal Capital Territory Administration Budget Capital reflected ~~₦~~29 Billion but there is no FCT in the Recurrent. Maybe it is an omission.

Senator Abdul-Aziz Murtala Nyako (Adamawa South): Mr. President, there was a question raised by the Leader on the issue of IDPs and we were supposed to receive an explanation on that Sir.

Senator Danjuma Goje: Mr. President, there is a provision of ~~₦~~12 Billion in the service wide votes for the North east IDPs.

The Chairman: If there is no any other comment, we should go to schedules.

SCHEDULE 1

PART A – STATUTORY TRANSFERS

STATUTORY TRANSFERS

~~₦~~70,000,000,000 for (NATIONAL JUDICIAL COUNCIL) – agreed to.

~~₦~~41,050,000,000 for (NIGER DELTA DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~77,110,000,000 for (UNIVERSAL BASIC EDUCATION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~115,000,000,000 for (NATIONAL ASSEMBLY) – agreed to.

~~₦~~2,000,000,000 for (PUBLIC COMPLAINTS COMMISSION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~45,000,000,000 for (INEC) – agreed to.

~~₦~~1,210,000,000 for (NATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~351,370,000,000 for (TOTAL STATUTORY TRANSFERS) – agreed to.

2138

SCHEDULE

PART B – DEBT SERVICE

~~₦~~1,307,400,000,000 for (DOMESTIC DEBTS) – agreed to.

~~₦~~54,480,000,000 for (FOREIGN DEBTS) – agreed to.

~~₦~~1,361,880,000,000 for (SUB-TOTAL) – agreed to.

SINKING FUND

~~₦~~113,440,000,000 for (SINKING FUND TO RETIRE MATURING LOANS) – agreed to.

~~₦~~113,440,000,000 for (SUB-TOTAL) – agreed to.

~~₦~~1,475,320,000,000 for (TOTAL DEBT SERVICE) – agreed to.

SCHEDULE

PART C – RECURRENT (NON-DEBT) EXPENDITURE

MINISTRY/DEPARTMENT/AGENCY

EXECUTIVE

~~₦~~2,480,584,709 for (AUDITOR GENERAL FOR THE FEDERATION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~7,737,100,536 for (BUDGET AND NATIONAL PLANNING) – agreed to.

~~₦~~29,632,584,416 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF AGRICULTURE) – agreed to.

~~₦~~312,213,355,618 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF DEFENCE) – agreed to.

~~₦~~367,734,727,223 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF EDUCATION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~14,515,408,468 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF ENVIRONMENT) – agreed to.

~~₦~~9,994,990,976 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF FINANCE) – agreed to.

~~₦~~39,440,096,249 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS) – agreed to.

~~₦~~221,412,548,087 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF HEALTH) – agreed to.

2139

2140

~~₦~~10,410,294,458 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF INDUSTRY, TRADE AND INVESTMENT) – agreed to.

~~₦~~38,729,446,483 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF INFORMATION & CULTURE) – agreed to.

~~₦~~451,942,552,070 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF INTERIOR)– agreed to.

~~₦~~17,389,782,636 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF JUSTICE)– agreed to.

~~₦~~7,735,604,366 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF LABOUR AND EMPLOYMENT) – agreed to.

~~₦~~9,402,106,704 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF SOLID MINERALS DEVELOPMENT)– agreed to.

~~₦~~1,970,127,331 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF NIGER DELTA) – agreed to.

~~₦~~54,336,926,923 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF PETROLEUM RESOURCES) – agreed to.

~~₦~~25,554,038,310for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY) – agreed to.

~~₦~~65,604,713 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF SPECIAL DUTIES SGF) – agreed to.

~~₦~~13,667,122,591 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF TRANSPORTATION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~7,219,056,441 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF WATER RESOURCES) – agreed to.

~~₦~~1,261,723,837 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF WOMEN AFFAIRS) – agreed to.

~~₦~~33,971,882,707for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF WORKS, POWER & HOUSING) – agreed to.

~~₦~~72,297,326,595for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF YOUTH & SPORTS DEVELOPMENT) – agreed to.

~~₦~~320,198,366 for (FISCAL RESPONSIBILITY COMMISSION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~5,029,989,359 for (INDEPENDENT CORRUPT PRACTICES AND RELATED OFFENCES COMMISSION)— agreed to.

APPROPRIATION

~~₦~~838,569,623 for (INFRASTRUCTURE CONCESSIONARY REGULATORY COMMISSION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~9,885, 909, 120 for (MINISTRY OF COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY) – agreed to.

~~₦~~625, 819, 413 for (NATIONAL SALARIES, INCOMES AND WAGES COMMISSION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~56, 791, 291, 063 for (NATIONAL SECURITY ADVISER) – agreed to.

~~₦~~6,270,657,023 for (OFFICE OF THE HEAD OF THE CIVIL SERVICE OF THE FEDERATION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~21,676,277,888 for (PRESIDENCY) – agreed to.

~~₦~~45,890,745,817 for (SECRETARY TO THE GOVERNMENT OF THE FEDERATION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~1, 898,444,450,116 for **(SUB-TOTAL: EXECUTIVE)** – agreed to.

FEDERAL EXECUTIVE BODIES

~~₦~~2,036,983,075 for (CODE OF CONDUCT BUREAU) – agreed to.

~~₦~~551,873,810 for (CODE OF CONDUCT TRIBUNAL) – agreed to.

~~₦~~2, 064, 672 for (FEDERAL CHARACTER COMMISSION), 500 – agreed to.

~~₦~~992, 548, 019 for (FEDERAL CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~4, 911, 777, 812 for (NATIONAL POPULATION COMMISSION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~676, 965, 000 for (POLICE SERVICE COMMISSION) - agreed to.

~~₦~~2,044,284,712 for (REVENUE MOBILISATION, ALLOCATION AND FISCAL COMMISSION) - agreed to.

~~₦~~13, 279, 104, 928 for **(SUB –TOTAL: FEDERAL EXECUTIVE BODIES)** - agreed to.

SERVICE-WIDE VOTES AND PENSIONS

EXPENDITURE ITEMS

PENSIONS AND GRATUITIES

TOTAL ALLOCATION: ₦188, 105, 681, 152

~~₦~~33,290,715,716 for (OFFICE OF THE HEAD OF THE CIVIL SERVICE (CIVILIAN PENSION) – agreed to.

2141

₦28,391,013,524 for (PENSIONS) – agreed to.

₦2,300,000,000 for (GRATUITIES) – agreed to.

₦2,599,702,192 for (BENEFITS OF RETIRED HEADS OF THE CIVIL SERVICE OF THE FEDERATION AND FEDERAL PERMANENT SECRETARIES – agreed to.

₦67, 629, 949, 771 for **(MILITARY PENSIONS AND GRATUITIES (DMP) – agreed to.**

₦59,803,309,186 for (PENSIONS) – agreed to.

₦3,523,892,396 for (2016 EXPECTED RETIREES) – agreed to.

₦4, 302, 748, 189 for (DEATH BENEFITS) – agreed to.

₦7,412,463,652 for (POLICE PENSIONS AND GRATUITIES) – agreed to.

₦7,412,463,652 for (PENSIONS) – agreed to.

₦8,420,000,000 for (CUSTOMS, IMMIGRATION AND PRISONS PENSION OFFICE) – agreed to.

₦8,420,000,000 for (PENSIONS) – agreed to.

₦14,343,326,479 for (UNIVERSITIES' PENSIONS INCLUDING ARREARS) – agreed to.

₦14,343,326,479 for (PENSIONS) – agreed to.

₦26,756,754,031 for (PARASTATALS' PENSION AND RAILWAY PENSIONS) – agreed to.

₦26,756,754,031 for (PENSIONS) – agreed to.

₦2,257,298,262 for PRE-1996 NIGERIA RAILWAY CORPORATION PENSION) – agreed to.

₦2,257,298,262 for (PENSIONS) – agreed to.

₦7,643,405,446 for (DEPARTMENT OF STATE SECURITY) – agreed to.

₦7,643,405,446 for (PENSIONS, INCLUDING ARREARS) – agreed to.

₦7,643,405,446 for (DEPARTMENT OF STATE SECURITY) – agreed to.

₦7,643,405,446 for (PENSIONS (INCLUDING ARREARS) – agreed to.

2142

₦3,709,146,567 for (NIGERIA INTELLIGENCE AGENCY) – agreed to.

₦3,709,146,567 for (PENSIONS/DEPENDANTS BENEFITS) – agreed to.

₦16,642,621,229 for (NELMCO) – agreed to.

₦16,642,621,229 for (NELMCO PENSIONS/ARREARS) – agreed to.

SERVICE WIDE VOTES

₦546,560,000,000 for (TOTAL ALLOCATION) – agreed to.

₦110,000,000,000 for (SERVICE-WIDE VOTES PENSIONS) – agreed to.

₦3,000,000,000 for (ARREARS OF PAYG PENSION INCLUDING DPR) – agreed to.

₦110,000,000,000 for (ARREARS OF 33% INCREASE IN PENSION RATES) – agreed to.

₦500,000,000 for (PAYMENT OF OUTSTANDING DEATH BENEFITS TO CIVIL SERVANTS) – agreed to.

₦50,195,808,918 for (PAYMENT INTO THE REDEMPTION FUND (5% OF TOTAL PERSONNEL COST) INCLUDING ARREARS OF 2014 AND 2015) – agreed to.

₦3,750,000,000 for (AREARS OF POLICE DEATH BENEFITS (2004- 2010) – agreed to.

₦14,690,036,516 for (GROUP LIFE INSURANCE FOR ALL MDAs INCLUDING DSS/INSURANCE OF SENSITIVE ASSETS/CORPERS) – agreed to.

APPROPRIATION

₦1,000,000,000 for (ARMED FORCES ENHANCEMENT BENEFITS OF COMMODORES AND ABOVE ETC) – agreed to.

₦2,795,000 for (SEVERANCE BENEFITS OF THE DELTA STEEL COMPANY/PENSION PAY OFF) – agreed to.

₦36,000,000 for (ADMINISTRATION AND MONITORING OF (CHCSF) GROUP LIFE) – agreed to.

₦200, 000,000 for (PENSION VERIFICATION AND ADMINISTRATION) – agreed to.

2143

₦2,300,000,000 for (ENLTITLEMENT OF FORMER PRESIDENTS/HEAD OF STATE AND VICE-PRESIDENTS/CHIEF OF GENERAL STAFF) – *agreed to.*

₦1,500,000,000 for (PUBLIC SERVICE REFORMS (INCLUDING PAYMENT OF SEVERANCE BENEFITS OF CIVIL SERVANTS) – *agreed to.*

₦436, 560,000,000 for (OTHER SERVICE WIDE VOTES) – *agreed to.*

₦10,256,000,000 for (IMPROVED RUMUNERATION FOR THE NIGERIAN POLICE INCLUDING 2014 AND 2015 SHORTFALLS) – *agreed to.*

₦400, 000,000 for (35TH ANNUAL GENERAL MEETIN AND SYMPOSIUM OF SHELTER AFRIQUE IN NIGERIA IN JUNE, 2016) – *agreed to.*

₦33,597,400,000 for (PUBLIC SERVICE WAGE ADJUSTMENT FOR MDAs (INCLUDING ARREARS OF PROMOTION AND SALARY INCREAMENT) – *agreed to.*

₦3,000,000,000 for (OUTSTANDING PAYMENTS TO HEALTH PROFESSIONALS)–*agreed to.*

₦13, 000,000,000 for (OPERATIONS - INTERNAL FOR THE ARMED FORCES) – *agreed to.*

₦6,000,000,000 for (CONTRIBUTION TO INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATIONS INCLUDING WAEC INTERNATIONAL) – *agreed to.*

₦208, 000,000 for (CONTRIBUTION TO INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATIONS INCLUDING WAEC INTERNATIONAL) – *agreed to.*

₦3,500,000,000 for (ASSESSED CONTRIBUTION TO AFRICAN UNION AND OTHERS) – *agreed to.*

₦6,000,000,000 for (CONTRIBUTION TO INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATIONS INCLUDING WAEC INTERNATIONAL) – *agreed to.*

₦8,500,000,000 for (EXTERNAL FINANCIAL OBLIGATIONS) – *agreed to.*

₦12, 000,000,000 for (CONTINGENCY) – *agreed to.*

₦500, 000,000 for (PILGRIMS SUPPORT SERVICES) – *agreed to.*

₦500, 000,000 for (ELECTION LOGISTICS SUPPORT) – *agreed to.*

2144

₦4,000,000,000 for (EMPLOYEES COMPENSATION ACT – EMPLOYEES COMPENSATION FUND)– *agreed to.*

₦2, 500,000,000 for (PROVISION OF EQUIPMENT FOR SELECTED PUBLIC BUILDINGS) – *agreed to.*

₦2, 000,000,000 for (PAYMENT FOR OUTSTSOURCED SERVICES)– *agreed to.*

₦1,000,000,000 for (SERVICE WID TRAINING OF BUDGET/PLANNING OFFICERS ON GIFMIS BUDGET PREPARATION SYSTEM (BPS) AS WELL AS MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF ALL PROJECT NATIONWIDE) – *agreed to.*

₦8, 000,000,000 for (OPERATION LAFIYA DOLE) – *agreed to.*

₦4, 000,000,000 for (IPPIS CAPTURING – *agreed to.*

₦300,000,000,000for (SPECIAL INTERVENTION (RECRUITMENT) – *agreed to.*

₦20,000,000,000 for (PRESIDENTIAL AMNESTY PROGRAMME) – *agreed to.*

₦7, 875,000,000 for (NIGER-DELTA EX-MILITANTS) – *agreed to.*

₦1,834,149,261for (PRESIDENTIAL AMNESTY PROGRAMME OPERATIONAL COST) – *agreed to.*

₦10, 290,850,739for (MILITANTS) – *agreed to.*

₦734, 665,681,152 for (TOTAL CRF CHARGES) – *agreed to.*

₦2, 646,389,196 for (TOTAL RECURRENT (NON-DEBT) – *agreed to.*

SCHEDULE

PART D – CAPITAL EXPENDITURE

₦317,509,819 for (AUDITOR GENERAL FOR THE FEDERATION) – *agreed to.*

₦2,322,144,778 for (BUDGET AND NATIONAL PLANNING) – *agreed to.*

₦46,173,963,859 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF AGRICULTURE) – *agreed to.*

₦130,864,439,542 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF DEFENCE) – *agreed to.*

2145

~~₦~~35,433,487,466 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF EDUCATION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~4,957,964,638 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF ENVIRONMENT) – agreed to.

~~₦~~667,842,500 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF FINANCE) – agreed to.

~~₦~~7,076,226,760 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS) – agreed to.

~~₦~~28,650,342,987 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF HEALTH) – agreed to.

~~₦~~5,886,327,845 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF INDUSTRY, TRADE AND INVESTMENT) – agreed to.

~~₦~~6,071,503,956 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF INFORMATION AND CULTURE) – agreed to.

~~₦~~61,713,279,744 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF INTERIOR) – agreed to.

~~₦~~879,736,744 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF JUSTICE) – agreed to.

~~₦~~5,542,655,626 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF LABOUR AND EMPLOYMENT) – agreed to.

~~₦~~7,332,623,257 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF SOLID MINERALS DEVELOPMENT) – agreed to.

~~₦~~29,297,122,872 for (FEDERAL CAPITAL TERRITORY ADMINISTRATION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~19,440,328,551 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF NIGER DELTA) – agreed to.

~~₦~~6,304,900,570 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF PETROLEUM RESOURCES) – agreed to.

~~₦~~27,006,179,073 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY) – agreed to.

~~₦~~188,674,679,674 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF TRANSPORTATION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~46,081,121,423 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF WATER RESOURCES) – agreed to.

~~₦~~2,293,528,977 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF WOMEN AFFAIRS) – agreed to.

~~₦~~422,964,928,495 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF WORKS, POWER AND HOUSING) – agreed to.

2146

~~₦~~3,497,043,000 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF YOUTH & SPORTS DEVELOPMENT) – agreed to.

~~₦~~123,044,650 for (FISCAL RESPONSIBILITY COMMISSION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~799,680,570 for (INDEPENDENT CORRUPT PRACTICES AND RELATED OFFENCES COMMISSION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~35,730,000 for (INFRASTRUCTURE CONCESSIONARY REGULATORY COMMISSION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~5,992,735,230 for (MINISTRY OF COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY) – agreed to.

~~₦~~169,871,885 for (NATIONAL SALARIES INCOMES AND WAGES COMMISSION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~32,084,085,624 for (NATIONAL SECURITY ADVISER) – agreed to.

~~₦~~1,429,176,735 for (OFFICE OF THE HEAD OF THE CIVIL SERVICE OF THE FEDERATION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~23,004,199,702 for (PRESIDENCY) – agreed to.

~~₦~~20,319,288,049 for (SECRETARY TO THE GOVERNMENT OF THE FEDERATION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~1,173,407,694,354 for (SUB-TOTAL EXECUTIVE) – agreed to.

FEDERAL EXECUTIVER BODIES

~~₦~~4,889,127,358 for (CODE OF CONDUCT BUREAU) – agreed to.

~~₦~~1,055,560,066 for (CODE OF CONDUCT TRIBUNAL) – agreed to.

~~₦~~984,780,230 for (FEDERAL CHARACTER COMMISSION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~16,841,017 for (FEDERAL CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~4,411,606,590 for (NATIONAL POPULATION COMMISSION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~269,629,000 for (POLICE SERVICE COMMISSION) – agreed to.

~~₦~~19,883,417 for (REVENUE MOBILISATION ALLOCATION AND FISCAL COMMISSION) – agreed to.

2147

₦11,647,427,678 for (SUB-TOTAL: FEDERAL EXECUTIVE BODIES) – agreed to.

CAPITAL SUPPLEMENTATION

₦402,542,999,999 for (TOTAL ALLOCATION) – agreed to.

₦2,000,000,000 for (NATIONAL JOB CREATION SCHEME/GRADUATE INTERSHIP SCHEME) – agreed to.

₦527,259,306 for (QUICK WINS – COMPLETION OF 2008 AND 2009 PROJECTS) – agreed to.

₦3,000,000,000 for (NELMCO (OUTSTANDING LIABILITIES) – agreed to.

₦3,432,000,000 for (BULK TRADER) – agreed to.

₦10,000,000,000 for (SINKING FUND FOR INFRASTRUCTURAL DEVELOPMENT) – agreed to.

₦1,500,000,000 for (SPECIAL INITIATIVE FOR WOMEN PARTICIPATION IN AGRICULTURE, WATER, SPORT, COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY/PARTNERSHIP WITH STATES AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT WOMEN DEVELOPMENT CENTRES) – agreed to.

₦1,000,000,000 for (GIFMIS CAPITAL) – agreed to.

₦2,500,000,000 for (2011 ELECTION VIOLENCE AND CIVIL DISTURBANCES (DAMAGE DONE TO PUBLIC PROPERTIES AND PLACES OF WORSHIPS) – agreed to.

₦1,000,000,000 for (SPORT DEVELOPMENT) – agreed to.

₦8,267,215 for (SPECIAL INTERVENTION MDG'S (VERIFICATION OF ASSETS AND LIABILITIES) – agreed to.

₦609,037,225 for (TRANSITION TO SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS) – agreed to.

₦3,378,044,922 for (PROVISION FOR SDG PROGRAMMES) – agreed to.

₦581,777,918 for (SDG MONITORING AND EVALUATION) – agreed to.

₦474, 533,376 for (CONSULTANCY, FEES, SURVEY AND SHORT TERM AND LONG TERM STUDIES) – agreed to.

2148

₦427, 080, 038 for (COMMUNICATION AND ADVOCACY (SDG) – agreed to.

₦500,000,000 for (FEDERAL MINISTRY OF FINANCE: SPECIAL PROGRAMME FOR IMPROVING EFFICIENCY) – agreed to.

₦5,500,000,000 for (CAPITAL EXIGENCIES /ADJUSTMENT TO CAPITAL COST) – agreed to.

₦4,000,000,000 for (CAPITAL DEVELOPMENT OF NATIONAL INSTITUTE FOR LEGISLATIVE STUDIES) – agreed to.

₦1,000,000,000 for (NATIONAL ASSEMBLY CLINIC) – agreed to.

₦500,000,000 for (MINISTRY OF BUDGET AND NATIONAL PLANNING (INFRASTRUCTURE MASTER PLAN) – agreed to.

₦2,000,000,000 for (NIGERIA MORTGAGE REFINANCING COMPANY (NMRC)) – agreed to.

₦1,000,000,000 for (HEAD OF SERVICE (FEDERAL GOVERNMENT STAFF HOUSING LOANS BOARD) – agreed to.

₦100,000,000,000 for (SPECIAL INTERVENTION/CONSTITUENCY PROJECTS) – agreed to.

₦12,000,000,000 for (FEDERAL INITIATIVE FOR NORTH-EAST (PILOT COUNTERPART FUNDING CONTRIBUTION) – agreed to.

₦3,500,000,000 for (COUNTERPART FUNDING INCLUDING GLOBAL FUND/HEALTH) – agreed to.

₦500,000,000 for (SUPPORT TO UNDP MILLENNIUM CAMPAIGN PROGRAMME NIGERIA IN AFRICA/AFRICA PARLIAMENTARIAN PROGRAMME) – agreed to.

₦25,500,000,000 for (PAYMENT OF LOCAL CONTRACTORS' DEBTS/OTHER LIABILITIES) – agreed to.

₦3,100,000,000 for (GALAXY BACKBONE) – agreed to.

₦5,005,000,000 for (REFUNDS TO STATES FOR FEDERAL ROADS PROJECTS) – agreed to.

₦2,000,000,000 for (FINANCING OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE NIGERIA'S NUCLEAR POWER PROGRAMME (THE SEED MONEY) – agreed to.

2149

~~₦1,000,000,000~~ for (MATCHING GRANT FOR THE “SAFE SCHOOL INITIATIVE” PROGRAMME) – agreed to.

~~₦500,000,000~~ for (REHABILITATION OF EXISTING 23 NOS. FEDERAL SECRETARIATS IN THE STATES OF THE FEDERATION) – agreed to.

~~₦500,000,000~~ for (CONSTRUCTION OF FEDERAL SECRETARIAT IN EKITI STATE) – agreed to.

~~₦4,000,000,000~~ for (DEVELOPMENT FINANCE INSTITUTION (DFI)) – agreed to.

~~₦200,000,000,000~~ for (CAPITAL IN FGN SPECIAL INTERVENTION PROGRAMME) – agreed to.

~~₦402, 542,999,999~~ for (TOTAL - CAPITAL SUPPLEMENTATION) – agreed to.

~~₦1,587,598,122,031~~ for (CAPITAL DEVELOPMENT FUND) – agreed to.

~~₦1,587,598,122,031~~ for (TOTAL CAPITAL EXPENDITURE) – agreed to.

~~₦6,060,677,358,227~~ for (AGGREGATE EXPENDITURE) – agreed to.

Senator Dino Melaye: I have an observation, Mr Chairman.

The Chairman: What is your observation, Senator Dino Melaye?

Senator Dino Melaye: Mr Chairman, I do observe that the budget of the FCT that is ~~₦37, 756, 967, 983~~ Capital, has been wrongly computed to be ~~₦29,297,122,872~~. The Chairman Appropriation should note this correction before we pass.

Senator Mohammed Danjuma Goje: Mr Chairman, I want to assure the Chairman FCT that no kobo has been taken from FCT and transfer to anywhere, if there is error, it must be arithmetical or typographical error. But I assure him that nothing has been taken from FCT to other Ministry, we have not done that. Let the Senate note it.

The Chairman: Let us go to the Clauses.

Clause 1 – (ISSUE AND APPROPRIATION OF ~~₦6,060,677,358,227~~ FROM THE CONSOLIDATED REVENUE FUND FOR 2016) – ordered to stand part of the Schedule.

Clause 2 – (RELEASE OF FUNDS FROM THE CONSOLIDATED REVENUE FUND) – ordered to stand part of the Schedule.

2150

Clause 3 – (VIREMENT) – ordered to stand part of the Schedule.

Clause 4 – (EXCESS REVENUE) – ordered to stand part of the Schedule.

Clause 5 – (AUTHORIZATION) – ordered to stand part of the Schedule.

Clause 6 – (RELEASE OF FUNDS FOR IMPLEMENTATION) – ordered to stand part of the Schedule.

Clause 7 – (DUE PROCESS CERTIFICATION) – ordered to stand part of the Schedule.

Clause 8 – (INFORMATION ON INTERNALLY GENERATED REVENUE) – ordered to stand part of the Schedule.

Clause 9 – (INFORMATION ON EXTRA BUDGETARY/FOREIGN ASSISTANCE) – ordered to stand part of the Schedule.

Clause 10 – (INTERPRETATION) – ordered to stand part of the Schedule.

Senator Bala Ibn Na'allah (Kebbi South): I have an observation, Mr Chairman.

The Chairman: Senator Na'allah, what is your observation?

Senator Bala Ibn Na'allah: Mr Chairman, it is just that when we come to do the final draft, this should be taking care of. If you look at Section 1 (iii) it says:

No part of the amount aforesaid shall be released from the Consolidated Revenue Fund of the Federation after the end of the year mentioned in subsection (1) of this section,

Section (1) is mentioning 31st day of December. If Section (2) is saying it is starting from that day which itself is a misnomer, it should be the commencement because the marginal line says commencement, so that it will be taken care of.

Clause 11 – (COMMENCEMENT) – ordered to stand part of the Schedule.

Clause 12 – (SHORT TITLE) – ordered to stand part of the Schedule.

Clause 13 – (LONG TITLE) – ordered to stand part of the Schedule.

2151

Senator Ndume Mohammed Ali: Mr. President, I move that the Chair report progress.

Senator Akpabio Godswill Obot: Mr. President, I second that the Chair report progress.

Question put and agreed to.

(The President resumed the Chair)

The President: Distinguished Colleagues, the Senate in the Committee of Supply consider the Report of the Committee on Appropriation on the 2016 Appropriation Bill and approved as follows:

SCHEDULE A - *agreed to*

SCHEDULE B - *agreed to*

Clause 1 - as recommended;

Clause 2 - as recommended;

Clause 3 - as recommended;

Clause 4 - as recommended;

Clause 5 - as recommended;

Clause 6 - as recommended;

Clause 7 - as recommended;

Clause 8 - as recommended;

Clause 9 - as recommended;

Clause 10 - as recommended;

Clause 11 - as recommended;

SHORT TITLE - as recommended;

Is this a true reflection of what transpired in the Committee of Supply?

Several distinguished Senators: Yes.

Senator Mohammed Ali Ndume: Mr. President, I move that the Bill be read the Third time.

Senator Godswill Obot Akpabio: Mr. President, I second the Motion that the Bill be read the Third time.

Question put and agreed to.

Bill read the Third Time and Passed.

2152

The President: Distinguished Colleagues, let me thank each and every one of you for your commitment and hard work in a statesmanship and manner with which we have worked to pass the 2016 Appropriation Bill. What is unique about this exercise is that there is no bickering over bench prices, rather, our devoted time and energy to ensure that we have a Budget that is implementable. The Budget reflects efficient and equitable allocation that will reduce the challenges of Nigerians. The Budget is now a product, by passing engagement, and commitment of one that is nationalistic. It gives me great joy to commend and appreciate all the efforts you have put in. It is the turn of the Executive to ensure full implementation of this Budget as part of the campaign to bring succour to our people.

While implementing, we charge the Executive to consider the areas of supporting Nigeria produced goods in order to help our economy. We have seen the earlier hiccups in the beginning of the Budget, we hope that by the time we are talking about 2017, the Agencies and Budget Office would have improve on every interaction. Government should bring the Budget much earlier to give us an ample time.

I also commend the Appropriation Committee and we have noted the areas of omission and we hope that the Executive should be able to address the different areas we have highlighted. We have particularly observe the fact that we have made an effort to reduce the size of the budget in our view to ensure that we reduce our deficit and also reduce our level of borrowing as much as possible; we will run the budget that is sustainable. We have played our part; the different agencies and Committees in the area of oversight should ensure that we have a budget that is fully implemented.

Nigerians have been waiting for us to pass the budget; this time, it is to the implementing agencies to ensure that they get to work quickly in implementing the budget. We on our part, we have one or two Bills that we will be considering on this Public Procurement Act to see what we can do to assist for easy and efficient implementing of the budget.

Once again, I thank you all for the work you have done and I think you will continue to show your commitment and patriotism to this great country. I thank you so much.

Suspension of other Items on the Order Paper

Senator Mohammed Ali Ndume: Mr. President, I move that we stand down the remaining items on the Order Paper till the next Legislative Day.

Senator Godswill Obot Akpabio: Mr. President, I second the motion moved by the Leader.

2153

Question put and agreed to.

(With the leave of the Senate, all other items on the Order Paper deferred till the next Legislative Day).

ADJOURNMENT

Senator Mohammed Ali Ndume: Mr. President, I move that the Senate do adjourn till 2:00 p.m. to adopt the Votes and Proceedings of today.

2154

Senator Godswill Obot Akpabio: Mr. President, I second the motion ably moved by the Leader.

Question put and agreed to.

Resolved: That the Senate do stand adjourned till later today, 23rd March 2016 at 2:00 p.m.

The Senate adjourned accordingly at 12:53 p.m.